## BEFORE THE

## NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

In the Matter of:

The New School

Case No. 2-RC-143009

And

Students Employees at The New School,

Petitioner.

Employer,

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to Notice, before Hearing Officer Greg Davis before the National Labor Relations Board, Region 2, at the Jacob K. Javits Federal Building, 26 Federal Building, Suite 3614, New York, NY 10278, in room 3611 on Wednesday, May 6, 2015, at 9:30 a.m.

1

## $\underline{\mathtt{A}} \ \underline{\mathtt{P}} \ \underline{\mathtt{P}} \ \underline{\mathtt{E}} \ \underline{\mathtt{A}} \ \underline{\mathtt{R}} \ \underline{\mathtt{A}} \ \underline{\mathtt{N}} \ \underline{\mathtt{C}} \ \underline{\mathtt{E}} \ \underline{\mathtt{S}}$

1	On behalf of the Employer:
2	
3	Douglas P. Catalano, Esquire
4	Norton, Rose, Fulbright, USA, LLP
5	666 Fifth Avenue
6	New York, NY 10103-3198
7	
8	On Behalf of the Petitioner:
9	
10	Thomas W. Meiklejohn, Esquire
11	Nichole Rothgeb, Esquire
12	Livingston, Adler, Pulda, Meiklejohn P.C
13	557 Prospect Avenue
14	Hartford, Connecticut 06105-2922
15	
16	
17	

1	$\underline{I} \ \underline{N} \ \underline{D} \ \underline{E} \ \underline{X}$							
2	WITNESS	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS	VOIR DIRE		
4	Ingrid Kvangraven	404	425	451				
5								

## $\underline{\mathtt{E}} \ \underline{\mathtt{X}} \ \underline{\mathtt{H}} \ \underline{\mathtt{I}} \ \underline{\mathtt{B}} \ \underline{\mathtt{I}} \ \underline{\mathtt{T}} \ \underline{\mathtt{S}}$

	EXHIBIT NUMBER	<u>IDENTIFIED</u>	RECEIVED				
2	Petitioner's						
3	P-18 Withdrawn		454				
4	P-19	408	409				
5	P-20	410	412				
6	P-21	411	412				
7	P-22	413	413				
8	P-23	413	415				
9	P-24	415	416				
10	P-25	418	418				
11	P-26	419	419				
12	P-27	421	422				
13	P-28	422	423				
14	P-29	453	454				
15							

1	Р	R	0	С	Ε	Ε	D	Ι	Ν	G	S	

- 2 (Time Noted: 9:45 a.m.)
- 3 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: In off-the-record discussions, I
- 4 understand that we have one witness today, and that witness
- 5 will be called by the Petitioner. Is that right, Ms. Rothgeb?
- 6 MS. ROTHGEB: Correct.
- 7 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Will your witness.
- 8 MS. ROTHGEB: Petitioner calls Ingrid Kvangraven.
- 9 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Come on up.
- 10 Whereupon,
- 11 INGRID KVANGRAVEN
- 12 was called as a witness by and on behalf of the Petitioner; and
- 13 having been duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
- 14 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Now please spell your first and
- 15 last name.
- 16 THE WITNESS: I N G R I D, my first name; and
- 17 K V A N G R A V E N is my last name.
- 18 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Ms. Rothqeb.
- 19 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 20 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 21 Q Good morning. Can we all call you Ingrid this morning?
- 22 A Yes; please.
- 23 Q So we don't mispronounce your last name repeatedly.
- 24 Could you tell us your connection to The New School.
- 25 A I'm a PhD student at The New School in Economics.

- 1 Q And what level of study are you in in your PhD path?
- 2 A I started at The New School two years ago as an MA
- 3 student, and I recently transferred to the PhD; this is in
- 4 January, so it's my second year at The New School.
- 5 Q And have you received your Masters?
- 6 A I'll be graduating with my MA in May.
- 7 Q Have you finished all your Masters coursework?
- 8 A I will by next week.
- 9 Q And when were you admitted to the PhD Program?
- 10 A January, 2015.
- 11 Q And you said your area of study is Economics?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q Is there any particular field in Economics?
- 14 A My specialty is Development Economics.
- 15 Q And could you tell us a little bit about your
- 16 educational background.
- 17 A I have a Masters in Development Studies and a Bachelor
- 18 in Development Studies as well.
- 19 Q And where are those degrees from?
- 20 A University of Oslow in Norway and London School of
- 21 Economics in the UK.
- 22 Q And during your time at The New School, have you held
- 23 any teaching or research-related positions?
- 24 A Yes; I'm currently a Teaching Assistant and Research
- 25 Assistant, actually.

- 1 Q And let's talk about your Teaching Assistant position
- 2 first. When did you -- what was the first Teaching Assistant
- 3 position you held at The New School?
- 4 A Fall, 2014, I started as a Teaching Assistant for the
- 5 course Development Economics, which is an MA course for
- 6 students in International Case.
- 7 Q And is that course taught out of NSSR?
- 8 A No. It's The New School For Public Engagement.
- 9 Q And you began that teaching position -- that TA position
- 10 while you were an MA student?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q And could you tell us what your duties and
- 13 responsibilities were generally in that course.
- 14 A I teach the lab, and I grade two assignments every
- 15 semester; and I attend the lectures.
- 16 Q How many lectures are there a week?
- 17 A There's one lecture a week and one lab for the week.
- 18 Q When you say, "teach the lab," what does that involved?
- 19 A I prepare the material and present the students with the
- 20 material and lab -- teach the course -- a part of the course,
- 21 basically.
- 22 Q Is the lab a separate section?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q How many times does the lab meet each week?
- 25 A Once.

- 1 Q And do you work under an instructor as a Teaching
- 2 Assistant for that course?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q And who is the Instructor?
- 5 A Professor Sakiko Fukudaparr.
- 6 Q Is that a faculty or adjunct?
- 7 A He's faculty.
- 8 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Could you spell the name of the
- 9 Professor?
- 10 MS. ROTHGEB: I think we're going to have --
- 11 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: In the documents? Okay.
- 12 Nevermind.
- MS. ROTHGEB: If that will be easier.
- 14 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Yes.
- 15 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 16 Q How did you obtain that position?
- 17 A I had a friend who was initially offered this position,
- 18 and he couldn't take it; and so he knew that I was interested
- 19 in this field and contacted me and asked if I would be
- 20 interested, which I was; and through him, I contacted her and
- 21 told her I was interested. And then I met with her, and that's
- 22 how I got the position.
- 23 Q If you could take a look at what's been pre-marked as
- 24 Petitioner's Exhibit 19.
- 25 A Yes?

- 1 Q And leaving aside the top part of the document where it
- 2 was forwarded to me, can you identify what this document is?
- 3 A This is the Professor answering my e-mail that I sent
- 4 after I heard about the Teaching Assistantship, asking if I
- 5 could meet with her to talk about the position.
- 6 MR. CATALANO: I gave it to my co-counsel here. Could
- 7 you tell me what the date is, because I have extra copies.
- 8 MS. ROTHGEB: May 5th.
- 9 MR. CATALANO: From whom to whom?
- 10 MS. ROTHGEB: It's Sakiko's response.
- 11 MR. CATALANO: Okay. All right. Thank you.
- 12 THE WITNESS: She responds, asking to meet with me.
- 13 (P-19 identified.)
- 14 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 15 Q And you're originally known as the bottom e-mail of the
- 16 chain?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 MS. ROTHGEB: Petitioner would move the exhibit.
- 19 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Any objection?
- 20 MR. CATALANO: This is the -- from the witness to Sakiko
- 21 9:16 a.m.?
- 22 MS. ROTHGEB: Yes; and then the response. The response
- 23 is right above it, May 6th at 9:45 a.m.
- MR. CATALANO: No objection.
- 25 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Petitioner's 19 is

- 1 admitted.
- 2 (P-19 received.)
- 3 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 4 Q How long was -- did you receive an appointment for this
- 5 Teaching Assistantship in the Fall of 2014?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q And how long an appointment was that for?
- 8 A It was for that semester.
- 9 Q Did you receive an appointment letter?
- 10 A No.
- 11 Q Did you fill out an application?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q You said you were -- you did meet with the Professor for
- 14 the --
- 15 A Yes; I did.
- 16 Q And was that an interview?
- 17 A I guess; yes. But I was offered the position while we
- 18 were talking.
- 19 Q And you accepted it, obviously?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q Have you held any other TA positions after this Fall
- 22 2014, appointment?
- 23 A I have that same position now.
- MR. CATALANO: Can we define "now"?
- MS. ROTHGEB: That was my next question.

- 1 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 2 Q That would be Spring 2015 Semester?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q And is it TA for the same course with the same faculty?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Have the duties changed at all?
- 7 A No.
- 8 Q And how did you obtain the second appointment in this
- 9 course?
- 10 A Towards the end of the semester of Fall 2014, she asked
- 11 if I would like to continue -- the Professor asked if I would
- 12 like to continue; and I accepted.
- 13 Q And if you could take a look at what's been pre-marked
- 14 as Petitioner's Exhibit 20.
- 15 Can you tell me what this document is?
- 16 A This is an e-mail of her asking me if we had already
- 17 talking about me continuing, and she's hoping and assuming that
- 18 I will continue in the Spring.
- 19 (P-20 identified.)
- 20 Q And did you answer her question about hoping or assuming
- 21 that you would continue?
- 22 A Yes; I wanted to continue.
- 23 Q And did you complete an application to continue?
- 24 A No.
- 25 Q Did you receive an appointment letter?

- 1 A No.
- 2 Q If you could take a look at what's been marked as
- 3 Petitioner's Exhibit 21 for me please.
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And could you take a look at this document and let me
- 6 know when you have had a chance to review.
- 7 A Yes; this is me accepting the Teaching Assistantship for
- 8 the Spring 2015. I'm sending this to the Secretary.
- 9 (P-21 identified.)
- 10 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 11 Q Okay. For the record, let me start with the bottom of
- 12 the chain. There's an e-mail from you to Phillip Akre. Who is
- 13 that?
- 14 A He's Secretary at NFPE, The New School for Public
- 15 Engagement.
- 16 Q And it's CC'd to the Professor; correct?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And you notified Phil that you accepted the position of
- 19 TA for Development Economics for Spring?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q And you asked when a good time would be to drop by your
- 22 office to renew the contract. What were you referring to in
- 23 renewing the contract?
- 24 A Renewing the contract for the Teaching Assistantship.
- 25 Q Was there some paperwork you thought you had to fill

- 1 out?
- 2 A Yes. I did fill out some paperwork the first time.
- 3 Q And in the next part of this e-mail chain, that's still
- 4 responding to you, "Hi, Ingrid:" on November 13?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q And he told you it won't be necessary for you to come
- 7 in; correct?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Did you go in to fill out paperwork anyway?
- 10 A No.
- 11 MS. ROTHGEB: Move Petitioner's Exhibits 20 and 21.
- 12 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Any objection?
- MR. CATALANO: No.
- 14 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Petitioner's 20 and 21 are
- 15 admitted.
- 16 (P-20 and P-21 received.)
- 17 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 18 Q Have you received any other teaching appointments at The
- 19 New School?
- 20 A I will be teaching the same course again next semester,
- 21 Fall Semester.
- 22 O And how did that come about?
- 23 A The Professor asked me one day if I would like to
- 24 continue.
- 25 Q If you could take a look at Petitioner's Exhibit 22,

- 1 please, Ingrid.
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Could you identify that document for me, please.
- 4 A This is the Professor asking if I would like to continue
- 5 TA'ing the course in the Fall.
- 6 (P-22 identified.)
- 7 Q And you agreed?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Did you fill out an application this time?
- 10 A No.
- 11 Q Did you receive any formal appointment letter?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q And have your duties for the upcoming course -- do you
- 14 expect them to be different at all?
- 15 A No; I expect them to be the same.
- 16 Q And is this the same faculty member again?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 MS. ROTHGEB: Petitioner moves 22.
- 19 MR. CATALANO: No objection.
- 20 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Petitioner 22 is admitted.
- 21 (P-22 received.)
- 22 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 23 Q Are you familiar with any pedagogical seminar or
- 24 workshops offered at The New School?
- 25 A I'm currently taking a pedagogy seminar.

- 1 Q And why are you taking that course?
- 2 A In order to improve my pedagogy skills.
- 3 Q Is that a required course?
- 4 A No.
- 5 Q And you're taking it now, Spring 2015?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q Did you take any sort of TA workshop when you first
- 8 began TA'ing?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q Did you have any sort of orientation?
- 11 A No.
- 12 Q If you could take a look at Petitioner's Exhibit 23,
- 13 please.
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q Do you recognize this document?
- 16 A Yes; this is the e-mail that goes out to all the NSSR
- 17 students, I think, calling for Teaching Assistantships for
- 18 undergraduate courses.
- 19 Q And this e-mail is dated March 14, 2014, "Looking for
- 20 applications for the 14-15 school year?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 (PE-23 identified.)
- 23 MS. ROTHGEB: Move Petitioner's Exhibit 23.
- 24 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Any objection?
- MR. CATALANO: No.

- 1 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Petitioner's 23 is admitted.
- 2 (P-23 received.)
- 3 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 4 Q Would you take a look at Petitioner's Exhibit 24,
- 5 Ingrid.
- 6 Do you recognize this document?
- 7 A Yes. This is the form you have to fill out if you want
- 8 to apply for one of these TA-ships.
- 9 Q And this, for the record, is a Teaching Assistantship
- 10 Form Application for years 2015-2016?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 (P-24 identified.)
- 13 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 14 Q Did you fill out an application like this for any of
- 15 your Teaching Assistant positions you held?
- 16 A No.
- 17 Q Have you filled out this form before?
- 18 A I think it filled it out in 2014.
- 19 Q But filling out the application isn't what resulted in
- 20 you getting the appointment for the Development Economics
- 21 Course?
- 22 MR. CATALANO: Objection.
- 23 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Overruled, you can cross.
- 24 THE WITNESS: No; this is for undergraduate courses --
- 25 Teaching Assistant's for undergraduate courses, but I taught in

- 1 a graduate course.
- MS. ROTHGEB: Move Petitioner's Exhibit 24.
- 3 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Any objection?
- 4 MR. CATALANO: No.
- 5 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: May I ask: Nevermind.
- 6 Petitioner's 24 is admitted.
- 7 (P-24 received.)
- 8 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 9 Q You mentioned you also have held Research Assistant
- 10 positions, Ingrid?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q When was the first Research Assistant position you held
- 13 at The New School?
- 14 A The one I currently have is one that started in
- 15 12/20/14, a Research Assistantship with Professor Sanjay Reddy.
- 16 Q And what are you doing in that Research Assistant
- 17 position?
- 18 A It's many different things. I maintain his website and
- 19 send out e-mails for him as well as articles to his course
- 20 website -- the two courses that he teaches, graduate and
- 21 undergraduate. We're also working on a paper together, so it's
- 22 actually research-related work.
- 23 And then like lots of small administrative tasks, like
- 24 mailing and work for him -- little things like that.
- 25 Q And who is Sanjay Reddy?

- 1 A He is Tenured Faculty Member in the Economics Department
- 2 of The New School.
- 3 Q And you said you're also working on a paper together?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q So what is your duties and responsibilities with regard
- 6 to working on that paper?
- 7 A We have met many times over the past year to talk about
- 8 like different aspects of the paper; and finally, I have
- 9 written a draft for half of the paper, and he is working on his
- 10 second part of the draft.
- 11 Q And is that -- you said that he's a Economics faculty
- 12 member, so is that an appointment out of The New School -- out
- 13 of NSSR?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q And how did you obtain that position?
- 16 A I knew the student who had the Research Assistantship
- 17 with him before, and I knew that he was looking for someone
- 18 new, that he was on sabbatical that year, so 2013-2014 he was
- 19 on sabbatical. His former RA put me in touch with him, and so
- 20 I met with him CUNY, which is where he was on sabbatical; and
- 21 then he offered me the position when I met with him.
- 22 Q And you said that was a year-long appointment?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q Could you take a look at Petitioner's Exhibit 25 please.
- 25 A This is -- I got an appointment letter for this -- the

- 1 Research Assistantship with Sanjay Reddy. I forwarded it to
- 2 him, and then at the top, you know, is him answering that he's
- 3 placed at the Center.
- 4 (P-25 identified.)
- 5 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 6 Q Are you planning to continue this --
- 7 MS. ROTHGEB: Move Petitioner's Exhibit 25.
- 8 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Any objection?
- 9 MR. CATALANO: No.
- 10 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Petitioner's 25 is admitted.
- 11 (P-25 received.)
- 12 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 13 Q Are you planning to continue in this relationship in the
- 14 upcoming semester?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q Why not?
- 17 A I initially declined because I had another job that took
- 18 too much time. Yes.
- 19 Q So was there a discussion about you continuing in this
- 20 position?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Between whom?
- 23 A Sanjay and I.
- 24 Q And if you could take a look at Petitioner's Exhibit 26.
- 25 And let me know when you've had a chance to review it.

- 1 A This is an e-mail chain. It's a conversation between
- 2 Professor Reddy and I about -- we are discussing if I will
- 3 continue or not; and at the end is the last e-mail is me saying
- 4 that I will give up the Research Assistantship.
- 5 (P-26 identified.)
- 6 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 7 Q And if you look at the e-mail that starts at the very
- 8 bottom of Page 1 and goes on to the top of Page 2, that's
- 9 Sanjay Reddy to you on March 2, 2015 -- do you see that one?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And in that e-mail chain, Sanjay Reddy indicates he
- 12 would support your continuance in the role if you chose?
- 13 A Yes.
- MS. ROTHGEB: Move Petitioner's 26.
- MR. CATALANO: No objection.
- 16 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Petitioner's 26 is admitted.
- 17 (P-26 received.)
- 18 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 19 Q And in Petitioner's 26, that's an e-mail, Sanjay already
- 20 refers to you having one role or both. Do you hold more than
- 21 one RA position with Dr. Reddy?
- 22 A Yes; I also assist him in his role as Director of
- 23 Undergraduate Studies in Economics.
- 24 Q Is that also an RA-ship?
- 25 A Yes.

- 1 Q And what are your duties and responsibilities in that
- 2 RA-ship?
- 3 A They're purely administrative. I help him organize one
- 4 event per semester for undergraduate students who might be
- 5 interested in majoring in Economics or who are already majoring
- 6 in Economics.
- 7 I send e-mails around to faculty members. I manage
- 8 information about the minors and majors and basically respond
- 9 to any requests that they ask regarding the undergraduate
- 10 program in Economics.
- 11 Q Now how did you obtain this position?
- 12 A I was asked if I could take it in August, 2014. I -- he
- 13 had an RA, actually, that had given up the position; and then I
- 14 was offered it since I already had another RA-ship with him.
- 15 Q And if you could take a look at Petitioner's Exhibit 27,
- 16 please. Let me know when you've had a chance to review the
- 17 whole thing.
- 18 A Yes. So this is an e-mail from Assistant Dean or Vice
- 19 Dean Tsuya Yee at NSSR.
- 20 Q Are you looking -- just to be clear for the record,
- 21 you're looking at the first e-mail in the chain, or --
- 22 A The newest e-mail in the chain, August 19, 2014; and she
- 23 is asking if I would like to take this job and saying this will
- 24 give me some extra money as well; and it will be around seven
- 25 hours a week.

1 (P-27 identified.)

- 2 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 3 Q And you accepted the position?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And how long was this RA-ship?
- 6 A One year.
- 7 Q And if you take a further look at Petitioner's
- 8 Exhibit 27, there's some further communication between you Ms.
- 9 Yee and you?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Could you tell me how those communications came about.
- 12 A So it starts with her e-mailing me and saying I have a
- 13 scholarship increase; and I answer and say, "Thank you" and ask
- 14 if there's any way that I can have a further increase; and she
- 15 says she'll get back to me.
- 16 Finally, she says that it's not possible to give a
- 17 further increase but -- and then she sends another e-mail
- 18 saying, "But you can have this job," the additional job with
- 19 Sanjay Reddy.
- 20 Q The second RA-ship?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q And why were you looking for a further increase to your
- 23 scholarship?
- 24 A Because even -- tuition is really high at The New
- 25 School; and even 50 per cent is not very much.

- 1 Q And are you continuing this RA-ship in the upcoming
- 2 year?
- 3 A No.
- 4 Q Why not?
- 5 A I gave up both at the same time for the same reason. I
- 6 had too much work.
- 7 MS. ROTHGEB: Move Petitioner's 27.
- 8 MR. CATALANO: No objection.
- 9 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Petitioner's 27 is admitted.
- 10 (P-27 received.)
- 11 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 12 Q If you could take a look at Petitioner's 28, please,
- 13 Ingrid. Could you tell me what this document is.
- 14 A This is an offer of a Prize Fellowship at The New
- 15 School. It's from Vice Dean Robert Kostrzewa offering me full
- 16 funding for the next three years as an Economics PhD student.
- 17 (P-28 identified.)
- 18 Q And have you accepted this Prize Scholarship?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q And the Fellowship requires you to work 20 hours per
- 21 week during the Fall and Spring semesters in your third year of
- 22 study?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q Is there any -- does accepting this scholarship provide
- 25 any limitations on your activities while you're receiving the

- 1 scholarship.
- 2 A I have been told that I'm not eligible to have Research
- 3 or Teaching Assistantships in the Economics Department the
- 4 first two years that I have this scholarship.
- 5 Q Is that limitation just in the Economics Department?
- 6 A It also applies to Undergraduate Teaching
- 7 Assistantships.
- 8 MS. ROTHGEB: Move Petitioner's Exhibit 28.
- 9 MR. CATALANO: No objection.
- 10 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Petitioner's 28 is admitted.
- 11 (P-28 received.)
- 12 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 13 Q Ingrid, what are your career aspirations after The New
- 14 School?
- 15 A I think I would like to work in academia.
- 16 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: I'm sorry?
- 17 THE WITNESS: I would like to work in academia, I think,
- 18 as of now, at least.
- 19 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 20 Q And is that part of the reason you've done this TA-ship
- 21 positions?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q Is there any other reason you've taken these TA-ship
- 24 positions?
- 25 A Well, also as a source of extra income.

- 1 Q And why did you choose to continue in TA-ing in the same
- 2 course rather than getting experience in other courses --
- 3 TA-ing in other courses?
- 4 A Well, when she asked me, I already knew that I wasn't
- 5 eligible for any of the TA-ships in the Economics Department,
- 6 so it made sense for me to accept this one. And also, it's
- 7 much easier to TA in something a third time than a first time;
- 8 so it's -- makes sense for me to do it.
- 9 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: When you said "she," you meant
- 10 --
- 11 THE WITNESS: Professor Sakiko.
- 12 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Thank you.
- 13 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 14 Q Do you know whether in the NSSR generally, or in
- 15 Economics specifically, continuation of RA-ships or TA-ships is
- 16 common?
- 17 MR. CATALANO: Objection.
- 18 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Basis?
- 19 MR. CATALANO: That can mean anything. We have numbers,
- 20 and common -- you know -- common for one person -- 400 people
- 21 -- 42 people. What is her definition of "common"? Does that
- 22 mean repetitive; once a week; once a month; once a year.
- 23 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: You can answer his questions,
- 24 too. No; just kidding. No; the objection is overruled. You
- 25 can cross if you need to.

- 1 Do you understand the question?
- THE WITNESS: Yes. I'm only familiar with the Economics
- 3 Department, and in the Economics Department, it's very common
- 4 for students to have RA-ships -- for them to be renewed the
- 5 following year.
- 6 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 7 Q And what's your basis for saying that?
- 8 A Just that's all the students that I know about. I
- 9 almost don't know anyone who hasn't had their RA-ship renewed.
- 10 MS. ROTHGEB: I have no further questions.
- 11 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Do you need a minute?
- MR. CATALANO: Thank you; yes.
- 13 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Let's go off the record.
- 14 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)
- 15 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Back on the record. Mr.
- 16 Catalano.
- 17 MR. CATALANO: Yes.
- 18 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 19 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 20 Q Ms. Kvangraven; is that somewhere in the ballpark?
- 21 A You can call me Ingrid.
- 22 Q Without being facetious, I would like to if you don't
- 23 mind.
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q Okay. Now are you an International Student?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Okay. And are you given guidance by The New School in
- 3 any respect about insuring that your tasks meet the criteria
- 4 established by the U. S. Government in order to maintain our
- 5 Visa? Are you advised?
- 6 A Yes; by International Student Services.
- 7 Q Okay. So they tell you that there are certain
- 8 requirements that you need meet in order to retain your Visa --
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q -- while being a student; correct?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Okay. Now in connection with your education, you were a
- 13 graduate of the University of Oslow -- a BA?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q Okay. What year was that?
- 16 A Two Thousand Six to Two Thousand Nine.
- 17 Q You graduated in 2009?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Okay. With a Bachelor of Arts -- a term that is used in
- 20 the United States?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Okay. And did you immediately go on with your
- 23 education?
- 24 A No; I took one year off.
- 25 Q And what did you do, if I might ask?

- 1 A I did an internship in Norway and -- for one semester --
- 2 and then I did an internship in Camaroon for one semester.
- 3 Q Okay. In connection with an educational program or
- 4 university or it was just "work" as the case -- not in any
- 5 delicate way -- using that term? Was it a "job" so to speak?
- 6 A It was -- well --
- 7 Q Cash?
- 8 A They were paid internships; yes; and they were not
- 9 through my university at all. I found both independently at
- 10 the school.
- 11 Q Yes. Okay. So you found this to be a worthwhile
- 12 endeavor away from the schooling for that one-year period?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q That's fair to say?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And irrespective of the amount, were you paid for those
- 17 two internships?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q And did there come a time that you chose not to continue
- 20 to do that, but rather to contain your attainment, ultimately,
- 21 of the degree which you are now seeking?
- 22 A Yes; well my plan the whole time was to get a Masters
- 23 after my Undergraduates.
- 24 Q All right. So you seek acting in those roles --
- 25 A Yes.

- 1 Q -- jobs, employment, otherwise fellowship; whatever you
- 2 want to call it -- and then you chose to go to get a Masters
- 3 Degree?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q Okay. And did you have -- did you apply to any number
- of schools or just to The New School?
- 7 A Well, I did a Masters before I came to The New School,
- 8 at another school.
- 9 Q Okay. Where was that?
- 10 A London School of Economics.
- 11 Q Yes. Okay. I'm sorry. So you're going for a second
- 12 Masters at The New School?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q Okay. What I meant was, after your "job" or that
- 15 one-year program that you were involved with, you then went on
- 16 to get a Masters --
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q -- and you enrolled at the London School of Economics?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q And for what period of time were you there?
- 21 A One year.
- 22 Q Okay. So that was --
- 23 A Twenty Ten to Twenty Eleven.
- Q Okay. And you then applied for -- to be enrolled at The
- 25 New School?

- 1 A I worked for two years in Norway first, and then I
- 2 wanted to go to The New School.
- 3 Q Okay. So I just want to get the continuum here. So you
- 4 worked from 2010 to 2012?
- 5 A I worked from 2011 to 2013.
- 6 Q Until 2013? In Oslow?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q Okay. And what did you do?
- 9 A I worked for an NGO, a non-governmental organization.
- 10 They worked with development policy. I was a political
- 11 adviser.
- 12 Q Okay. And that was employment?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q Okay. So you were an employee or -- what was your
- 15 title, Political Director?
- 16 A Political Adviser.
- 17 Q Political Adviser, yes. Okay. So during the period
- 18 from 2011 to 2013, you were employed by an NGO by the name of:
- 19 MS. ROTHGEB: Objection.
- 20 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Overruled.
- 21 THE WITNESS: Justus Network Norway
- 22 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 23 Q Okay. And did you choose to give up that employment and
- 24 then to go back for a Masters again?
- 25 A Yes.

- 1 Q And this time -- Okay.
- 2 And so you gave up that role, and you chose to be a
- 3 Masters student in Developmental Economics -- is that the term
- 4 -- as it is correctly used?
- 5 A Development Economics, but I'm as student in Economics.
- 6 Q Yes.
- 7 A But my field is Development Economics.
- 8 Q Okay. So how did it come about that you applied to The
- 9 New School? Did you have choices, or were you zeroed in on The
- 10 New School as the school as the school that you chose to apply
- 11 to?
- 12 A Yes; I heard about The New School when I did my first
- 13 Masters Degree in Development Studies, and this was when I
- 14 realized that I wanted to maybe switch to Economics; and the
- 15 type of Economics that's done at The New School is very
- 16 different than the way it's done anywhere else; so I wanted to
- 17 go to The New School, and my goal was to get the PhD.
- 18 Q Okay. At The New School as well?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q In this area of study?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Okay. So you chose to enroll at The New School; and
- 23 again, you chose your own words, not mine, because of the
- 24 academic programs that were being offered at The New School;
- 25 correct?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Particularly with Development Economics?
- 3 A Particularly Economics.
- 4 Q Okay. You didn't apply to any other schools; did you?
- 5 A No.
- 6 Q For this Masters Program and ultimately a PhD?
- 7 A No.
- 8 Q Okay. And at the time you applied, did The New School
- 9 administrators advise you that you would or would not
- 10 immediately become a TA or even broach the topic?
- 11 A No.
- 12 Q Okay. So that when you came in to the school, you had
- 13 no -- there was no discussion about assuming a role as a
- 14 graduate student TA, TF, RA, Research Associate; correct?
- 15 A Correct.
- 16 Q Okay. And so you come in to the school; and if I may,
- 17 are you pleased with the education you are getting; and are
- 18 things working out for you?
- 19 MS. ROTHGEB: Objection.
- 20 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Overruled.
- 21 THE WITNESS: (No audible response.)
- 22 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 23 Q I'm just talking about the education with these faculty
- 24 members.
- 25 A Yes.

- 1 Q Okay. So let's talk about the first faculty member whom
- 2 you interacted with, Professor Sakiko -- if that pronunciation
- 3 is somewhere in the ball park; and if not, pardon me.
- 4 A Sakiko.
- 5 Q Okay. So you became -- you first became enrolled at The
- 6 New School in what year?
- 7 A Twenty Thirteen.
- 8 Q Fall Semester?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Two Thousand Thirteen-Fourteen?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Correct?
- 13 A (No audible response.)
- 14 Q And in that year, if I understood your testimony
- 15 correctly, you didn't serve in any particular graduate student
- 16 role?
- 17 A I had an administrative job.
- 18 Q Administrative position?
- 19 A Well, they're called RA-ships, but --
- 20 Q Okay. What did you do?
- 21 A One of them was -- I helped collect information on
- 22 alumnae at The New School and took this information and put it
- 23 on the website and also updated the student directory. I was
- 24 basically managing like a part of the website.
- 25 Q So it was an administrative position in what area of The

- 1 New School?
- 2 A It was under the Chair of the Economics Department at
- 3 the time.
- 4 Q Okay. And did you do that for one semester or two
- 5 semesters?
- 6 A Two semesters; one year.
- 7 Q Okay. It had nothing to do with research or teaching?
- 8 A No.
- 9 Q Okay. And you then became aware, if you did, the
- 10 possibility of becoming a TA, a Teaching Assistant?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q And that's what you told us about.
- 13 And if I'm not mistaken again, one of your friends in
- 14 the Fall of 2014, perhaps had been slated to be that Teaching
- 15 Assistant to Professor Sakiko; and then he or she couldn't do
- 16 it, and he or she came to you and suggested that this might be
- 17 something that you might want to perform in the role of?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Correct?
- 20 A That's correct.
- 21 Q Okay. So when was that -- prior to the semester or at
- 22 the immediacy of the commencement of the semester?
- 23 A It was Spring, 2014. I guess in May, maybe -- around
- 24 May. It would be in the e-mails.
- 25 Q Okay. And in connection therewith, you then chose to

- 1 meet with Professor Sakiko?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Okay. And you and she described your interest -- or you
- 4 described your interest to her; and in general phraseology,
- 5 what did she say to you -- that you would be a good fit?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q Okay. And the reason that the two of you reached that
- 8 conceptual understanding is that this might be "a good fit,"
- 9 and those are my words again, not yours. Was that because of
- 10 your expertise in this area, because of your prior studies,
- 11 because of your interest in this particular area?
- 12 A She wants -- she generally always wants a Teaching
- 13 Assistant from the Economics Department, so it was primarily
- 14 the Economics part that she liked and not necessarily the
- 15 Development Studies part.
- 16 Q Okay. But this was an area in which you were ultimately
- 17 going to obtain a degree as a Masters student -- Economics?
- 18 A I'm getting a degree in Economics, not in Development
- 19 Economics.
- 20 Q Right. Okay. So you became a Teaching Assistant in
- 21 your area of studies?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q And I think you said there was not "appointment letter,"
- 24 but if I'm not mistaken there's been testimony that at least
- 25 certain documentation needed to be filled out in order to

- 1 assume that role. Was that totally incorrect?
- 2 It could have been after the fact; but in order to
- 3 receive the stipend, some documentation was filled out? That's
- 4 the question.
- 5 A Well, yes; there was something. I met with the
- 6 Secretary, and --
- 7 Q Okay. So you filled something out in the Fall of 2014
- 8 to become a TA?
- 9 A Spring of 2014; yes, in order to be a TA --
- 10 O TA in the Fall of 2014?
- 11 Okay. Now as far as the administrators whom you spoke
- 12 with, is it fair to say, in fact though, that you were retained
- 13 as a Teaching Assistant solely because of the interaction
- 14 between you and Professor Sakiko?
- 15 In other words, there wasn't another administrator who
- 16 was involved in that process; was there?
- 17 A I mean -- I had to meet with the Secretary.
- 18 Q But he or she didn't make that decision?
- 19 A Exactly; yes. It was Sakiko's decision.
- 20 Q Totally?
- 21 A I think so.
- 22 Q As far as you know?
- 23 A As far as I know.
- 24 Q Okay. And that was Fall of 2014, and that was for one
- 25 semester?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Okay. And you did not assume that role in the Spring of
- 3 2015; did you?
- 4 A I did.
- 5 Q Oh, it was for one year?
- 6 A Well, no; it was one semester at the time, and then she
- 7 asked me to do it again, and I did it again; and then --
- 8 Q Okay. Let me understand. Perhaps I misheard you.
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q You did, in the Fall of 2014, act as a TA?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q For what number of semesters; one or two?
- 13 A I initially got the job for one semester, but then she
- 14 asked me to do it for another semester; so I did it again.
- 15 I've done it twice, now.
- 16 Q I know you did it again, but let's go through the
- 17 semester.
- 18 In the Spring of 2015, she asked you to do it for the
- 19 Fall of 2015?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: No; no.
- 22 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 23 Q Okay. You did it in the Fall of 2014, and you're doing
- 24 it in the Spring of 2015?
- 25 A Yes.

- 1 Q Okay. And when did that appointment become known by you
- 2 to be possible?
- 3 A Towards the end of the Fall 2014 semester.
- 4 Q Okay. But during the Fall of 2014, you had no
- 5 expectation -- there was no commitment to you that you would do
- 6 it in the Spring of 2015; correct?
- 7 A Correct.
- 8 Q Okay. And what were the words, in formal substance,
- 9 that you and Professor Sakiko used in assuming this position
- 10 again in the Spring of 2015?
- 11 A You can see the wording in the e-mail. It said
- 12 something --
- 13 Q Okay.
- 14 A She said that she couldn't remember if she had already
- 15 asked me, but she was hoping and assuming that I would
- 16 continue.
- 17 Q Okay. And in connection with that role in both
- 18 semesters, did you use your experience in learning in Economics
- 19 in being the Teaching Assistant in that course?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q Okay. And are there any ingredients that you were
- 22 teaching or that you were participating in with the students
- 23 that pertained in part to your ultimate attainment of the PhD?
- In other words, are you going to use certain of that
- 25 information or the discipline itself as far as your ultimate

- 1 attainment of the degree? Did it have relevance to your PhD
- 2 area?
- 3 A Not directly.
- 4 Q Indirectly -- study of Economics? You weren't teaching
- 5 Math?
- 6 A That's true, but I'm teaching basic models -- basic
- 7 growth models. It's not something that I will use in my
- 8 dissertation.
- 9 Q Okay. Is there anything that you have obtained during
- 10 your several years at The New School that you will use in your
- 11 dissertation?
- 12 A I'm hoping to use some of the papers I started working
- 13 on in my classes.
- 14 Q How many papers are you working on, and in what class
- 15 are you working on those papers?
- 16 MS. ROTHGEB: Objection. Relevance.
- 17 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Well, it's a little -- I think
- 18 -- correct me if you're wrong, but you're trying to determine
- 19 whether any of the work which she did as a Teaching Assistant
- 20 or a Research Assistant is relevant or helpful in terms of her
- 21 academic --
- MR. CATALANO: Pursuit.
- 23 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: -- pursuit.
- 24 MS. ROTHGEB: The question was there anything she did --
- 25 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: No; I know. I'm trying to

- 1 clarify Counsel's question.
- 2 MR. CATALANO: The Hearing Officer has it correctly.
- 3 MS. ROTHGEB: If that's the question, I have no
- 4 objection.
- 5 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. So do you understand the
- 6 way we said your question? Did anything in the work that you
- 7 did in terms of your TA-ship or Research Assistant -- any of
- 8 that -- has that been helpful at all in terms of the academic
- 9 pursuit of your MA or PhD?
- 10 THE WITNESS: A lot of things that I've done in the
- 11 Teaching Assistantship job and in the Research Assistantship
- 12 job that I think will help me in my career?
- But I don't see direct relevance for my dissertation.
- 14 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Oh, you don't?
- 15 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 16 Q How about as a Research Associate? You just mentioned
- 17 that there were papers that you hoped to use in your
- 18 dissertation?
- 19 A We are working on a paper together which I'm very
- 20 excited about, but I'm -- I won't be able to use this as a part
- 21 of my dissertation.
- 22 Q The paper itself?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q How about anything that stems from the learning of
- 25 knowledge through the writing of the paper?

- 1 A Writing papers helps -- I mean writing papers in general
- 2 is good practice in order to like prepare myself for writing a
- 3 dissertation. So yes; in that sense, it's useful to write a
- 4 paper.
- 5 Q Okay. And you didn't mention what he paper is that you
- 6 wrote one-half of with Professor Reddy. What is it?
- 7 A We are -- we are trying to come up with a theory of the
- 8 purpose of global goals; so this is for the Sustainable
- 9 Development Goals that will be launched now in 2015, after the
- 10 Millennium Development Goals run out.
- We are trying to analyze like what role they can play;
- 12 so we're having a -- we have some critical perspective on the
- 13 way the Global Goals are used in development.
- 14 Q In Economic Development?
- 15 A In Economic Development.
- 16 Q Okay. And that's your area of study?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Okay. And how many hours did you expend in writing the
- 19 first half of this paper with Professor Reddy?
- 20 A I don't know; maybe ten.
- 21 O Ten hours?
- 22 A Or something like that.
- 23 Q That's all?
- 24 A Well, we met like a month ago and decided that now we've
- 25 done a lot of talking, and finally we're going to start writing

- 1 down our thoughts. So we gave ourselves a deadline of one week
- 2 to write half of the draft each.
- 3 Q So this is a draft. The paper is not complete by any
- 4 means; is it?
- 5 A Not by any means.
- 6 Q Okay. So is it -- do you envision that there will be a
- 7 lot of expenditure of time to complete this paper?
- 8 A We have to finish it by June, so there's a limit of how
- 9 much time I can spend.
- 10 Q Okay. Whom are you interacting with, other than
- 11 Professor Reddy, in writing this paper?
- 12 A It's just Professor Reddy and I.
- 13 Q Okay. And is he advising you, or you exchanging with
- 14 him your ideas in the preparation of this paper?
- 15 A We have been working together the whole year on this
- 16 paper.
- 17 Q The whole year?
- 18 A Yes; since Fall --
- 19 Q Well then I'm confused about hours. You said ten hours.
- 20 A But the thing is we haven't done any writing yet. Well,
- 21 we only just started writing. We've been doing a lot of
- 22 talking.
- 23 Q And the writing component in its final form, how many
- 24 hours would you envision that would expend?
- 25 A It's hard to say -- maybe another 10 -- 20 hours; maybe

- 1 I'm being optimistic.
- 2 Q For your portion?
- 3 A For my portion. I don't know.
- 4 Q How was the topic arrived at by you and or Professor
- 5 Reddy?
- 6 A Sanjay Reddy proposed or asked if I was interested in
- 7 collaborating on this type of paper.
- 8 Q And what did you tell him?
- 9 A Yes; I'm very --
- 10 Q And what was the reason you told him yes?
- 11 A I think it's a very interesting topic and very relevant
- 12 for Development Policy.
- 13 Q Okay. Are you getting a stipend?
- 14 A I am being paid to do this job; yes.
- 15 Q All right. Did you ever hear the word "stipend"?
- 16 A No.
- 17 Q You have never heard of that word?
- 18 A I've heard the word before, but I don't --
- 19 Q Do you know what that pertains to?
- 20 A In my understanding, a stipend is something you receive
- 21 in order to fund your studies.
- 22 Q And you don't know where --
- 23 A I will be receiving a stipend -- I mean I've received a
- 24 stipend for the next three years; and that is I don't have to
- 25 do any work for them.

- 1 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: You may want to look at
- 2 Petitioner's 27, an e-mail of July 16th at 5:14 p.m. She kind
- 3 of discusses the renumeration she is receiving.
- 4 MR. CATALANO: Now -- well, that's -- 27 does not
- 5 pertain to what we're talking about here.
- 6 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay.
- 7 MR. CATALANO: That's a different issue.
- 8 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 9 Q Okay. In fact, looking at 27, you note --
- 10 MS. ROTHGEB: Do you want her to look at 27?
- 11 MR. CATALANO: If she doesn't mind.
- 12 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 13 Q Will you look at 27, please.
- 14 A (No audible response.)
- 15 Q Do you have it, Ingrid?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Okay. Take a look in the middle. It says, "Dear Tsuya"
- 18 and in the third sentence, "I also understand that the school
- 19 has limited funds and I know this puts a lot of students in
- 20 very difficult situations."
- 21 What were you referring to as far as financial aid
- 22 available to students?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q Now in connection with the Research Assistantship with
- 25 Professor Reddy, how much are you getting, irrespective of what

- 1 we choose to call it?
- 2 A I think it's 5,100.
- 3 Q Okay. And how do you receive those -- that sum?
- 4 A Bi-weekly direct deposit payments.
- 5 Q Okay. Now is that over the course of the academic year
- 6 or over the course of a calendar year; do you know?
- 7 A Over the course -- as far as I understand, it's academic
- 8 year.
- 9 Q Academic year, okay. So let's use September 1 to May 31
- 10 just as a benchmark. Okay. And you get paid -- those balances
- 11 get deposited in your account every two weeks?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q Okay. And is there any timesheet that you fill out?
- 14 A No.
- 15 Q Okay. And during the intercession -- and was there an
- 16 intercession in the academic year 2014-2015?
- 17 A Christmas break?
- 18 Q Yes; we'll use that term; yes.
- 19 A Okay.
- 20 Q Holiday break -- Christmas break?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q For how long was that; approximately?
- 23 A Five weeks.
- 24 Q Five weeks; okay.
- 25 And were you interacting with Professor Reddy during

- 1 that five-week period?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q What did you do with him?
- 4 A I did quite a lot of my Research Assistant work in the
- 5 break because I had a lot of work in the Fall, and there were
- 6 certain things I asked him if I could do over the break instead
- 7 of in the Fall.
- 8 Q Okay. And were you interacting with him more or less
- 9 than you did during the academic year during when classes were
- 10 in session?
- 11 A I was interacting with him less because he was in India,
- 12 but I was doing more work.
- 13 Q Okay. Were there any holiday periods when you went home
- 14 to Oslow, assuming that that's where you come from -- and
- 15 pardon me if that's incorrect -- where you didn't perform any
- 16 work on or any other type of service as a Research Assistant?
- 17 A (No audible response.)
- 18 Q Did there come a time in a week or two weeks where,
- 19 because you were pursuing other aspects of your graduate
- 20 degree, that you didn't do Research Assistant work?
- 21 A I don't -- I don't know that I do work for him every
- 22 single week of the year; but generally, when I'm on vacation,
- 23 that's when I have time to do more work --
- 24 Q Okay.
- 25 A -- than --

- 1 Q But if you had to estimate, were there weeks perhaps
- 2 where you didn't do anything at all -- just one seven-day
- 3 period?
- 4 A There was probably a seven-day period that I didn't do
- 5 anything at all.
- 6 Q Okay. And did you receive this bi-weekly payment for
- 7 that period of time as well?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Okay. Are you expected -- or is it self-imposed
- 10 expectation -- if one exists -- that you are to follow the
- 11 direction of the Research PR, in this instance, Dr. Reddy? Do
- 12 you follow what he tells you to do?
- 13 A In my position as his Research Assistant?
- 14 Q Yes.
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Okay. Do you have discretion to ignore that direction?
- 17 A I don't know -- I don't think so.
- 18 Q Okay. Now are you performing any services this semester
- 19 in strictly an administrative role as well?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q Okay. And what is that -- that's as Director of
- 22 Undergraduate Studies Program?
- 23 A I am the Research Assistant for Dr. Reddy who is the
- 24 Director of Undergraduate Studies; yes.
- Q Okay. So that's separate and apart from the \$5,100?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Okay. And what are the administrative tasks relating to
- 3 that role?
- 4 A I plan one event per semester, so I already did that
- 5 this semester. I'm in touch with the Administration at Lang
- 6 Undergraduate Program when it comes to the Economics faculty
- 7 wanting to change the course requirements for the Economics
- 8 major, for example; or if they want a list of -- if the
- 9 Economics Department wants a list of Economics and
- 10 undergraduate majors or -- I mean like little issues like that
- 11 -- I'll be the one who gets in touch with the Administration at
- 12 Lang.
- 13 Q Okay. So there's no teaching involved, nor is there any
- 14 research?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q In that role -- pardon me.
- 17 A That's correct.
- 18 Q Now congratulations with respect to Petitioner's 28. If
- 19 you don't mind, would you take a look at that -- the letter
- 20 e-mail dated March 21st.
- 21 A Thank you.
- 22 Q Dean Kostrzewa says in the second paragraph, "The Prize
- 23 Fellowship is one of the highest honors to be bestowed on NSSR
- 24 students."
- Do you know how many fellow students have received this

- 1 honor?
- 2 A I believe there's two per department.
- 3 Q And you're using the term "department" to refer to the
- 4 Economics Department?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Okay. And are these PhD students alone, or are they
- 7 Master students?
- 8 A They're -- one of the conditions for the Prize is that
- 9 you have to be a first-year PhD student.
- 10 Q Okay. And how many PhD students are in the Economics
- 11 Department?
- 12 A I don't know -- you mean total?
- 13 Q I don't need an exact number, but if you can give us a
- 14 general -- and I'll be advised, of course, that this is based
- on not looking at enrollment forms; but if you had to guess; is
- 16 it 20, 30, 400?
- 17 MS. ROTHGEB: Objection; she said she didn't know.
- 18 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Overruled.
- 19 MR. CATALANO: Well, there are classes that she's
- 20 sitting in, I assume, or --
- MS. ROTHGEB: But he asked for the whole program.
- 22 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Overruled. Overruled. You can
- 23 answer the question. To the best of your knowledge, how many
- 24 PhD students are there in their first year?
- 25 THE WITNESS: In their first year?

- 1 MR. CATALANO: I said in the Economics Department.
- 2 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay.
- 3 THE WITNESS: I would guess between -- I don't know --
- 4 40 and 100.
- 5 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 6 Q Okay. That's fair. Okay. And do you have any idea how
- 7 many are in their first year, approximately?
- 8 A Maybe between five and ten.
- 9 Q Okay. And you're one of two students; or is it one who
- 10 received this honor?
- 11 A There's two.
- 12 Q There's two of you?
- 13 A (No audible response.)
- 14 Q Okay. And do you know why -- or were you advised why
- 15 you received this honor?
- 16 A Because the Department recognizes my academic
- 17 excellence. That's what it says.
- 18 Q Fair enough. Okay. And if you don't mind -- and you
- 19 can blush -- how well are you doing compared to what I would do
- 20 or Mr. Meiklejohn would do --
- 21 MS. ROTHGEB: Objection.
- 22 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 23 Q -- I mean do you have a 4.0 or --
- 24 MS. ROTHGEB: Objection.
- 25 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Sustained; you can rephrase the

- 1 question.
- 2 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 3 Q I'll take out the reference to Mr. Meiklejohn. What's
- 4 your grade point average --
- 5 MS. ROTHGEB: Objection.
- 6 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Overruled.
- 7 THE WITNESS: My grade point average is 3.96.
- 8 BY MR. CATALANO:
- 9 Q Now in connection with this \$20,000 annual stipend, are
- 10 you -- according to this document, you are not permitted to
- 11 work or to perform in these positions otherwise -- TA, RA?
- 12 A My understanding is that I'm not eligible to have a TA
- 13 or RA-ship in the Economics Department.
- 14 Q Okay. And did anybody tell you why?
- 15 A My understanding is that --
- 16 Q Well, you used the word "understanding," and I don't
- 17 mean to interrupt you, pardon me; but did anybody tell you why?
- 18 Understanding can come about in a lot of different ways. I can
- 19 read it; I think -- were you told?
- 20 A I have heard from Academic Affairs that I'm not
- 21 eligible, and I think that it's because it would be an unfair
- 22 distribution of resources.
- MR. CATALANO: Okay. Can you give us just one second.
- 24 I am nearing the end.
- 25 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Sure; I just have a question

- 1 before we go off the record.
- You had your first Teaching Assistantship that you were
- 3 performing in an administrative role? Do you remember that?
- 4 THE WITNESS: Before my Teaching Assistantship, no.
- 5 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: You had an administrative --
- 6 THE WITNESS: I had an administrative job in my first
- 7 year.
- 8 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Yes. For that role, were you
- 9 paid a stipend?
- 10 THE WITNESS: I was paid for that job, yes.
- 11 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Do you remember how much
- 12 it was?
- 13 THE WITNESS: I think -- if I remember correctly, I
- 14 think it was 2,500 for the year.
- 15 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: For the year?
- 16 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 17 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Thank you.
- 18 Let's go off the record.
- 19 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)
- 20 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Let's go back on the
- 21 record. Mr. Catalano?
- 22 MR. CATALANO: I have nothing else. Thank you.
- 23 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Ms. Rothgeb?
- MS. ROTHGEB: Just a few questions.
- 25 CROSS-EXAMINATION

- 1 BY MS. ROTHGEB:
- 2 Q Ingrid, when you said you went to fill out some forms
- 3 related to your TA-ship; do you recall whether it was an
- 4 application form?
- 5 A It was not an application form. It was something to do
- 6 with like how I would get paid.
- 7 Q And with regard to how you get paid, I think you said
- 8 you get direct deposits?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Do you know if taxes are taken out of monies that you
- 11 receive?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q Yes; you know, or yes; they are?
- 14 A Yes; I know, and yes; they are.
- 15 Q And finally, what is your specific area of study and
- 16 your dissertation subject matter?
- 17 A I am planning on studying Financialization in Saharan
- 18 African Countries.
- 19 MS. ROTHGEB: I have no further questions.
- 20 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Mr. Catalano?
- MR. CATALANO: Neither do I. Thank you.
- 22 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Great. Thank you; you're
- 23 dismissed.
- 24 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 25 (Witness dismissed.)

- 1 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Is there anything further today?
- 2 MR. CATALANO: No -- yes. Not for this witness.
- 3 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: No further testimony today?
- 4 MR. CATALANO: We have documents that I could introduce
- 5 now.
- 6 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. So let's go off the
- 7 record.
- 8 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)
- 9 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: I understand there's no further
- 10 testimony today; is that correct?
- 11 MR. CATALANO: Correct.
- 12 MS. ROTHGEB: Correct.
- 13 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. I also understand that
- 14 Petitioner wishes to offer a document at this time; is that
- 15 correct, Ms. Rothgeb?
- 16 MS. ROTHGEB: Correct.
- 17 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: And what is that?
- 18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: We've had marked for identification
- 19 Petitioner's Exhibit 29, the recently-executed Collective
- 20 Bargaining Agreement between NYU and UAW covering Graduate
- 21 Student Employees.
- 22 (P-29 identified.)
- MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I understand that Counsel has --
- 24 there's no dispute as to the authenticity of the document, and
- 25 the -- well, I quess I shouldn't have stated that; but I

- 1 understand the Employer has the same objection as he had for
- 2 the first exhibits.
- 3 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Mr. Catalano?
- 4 MR. CATALANO: It's true.
- 5 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. I've admitted other
- 6 Collective Bargaining Agreement's in this proceeding,
- 7 particularly Employer's A through -- I believe it's --
- 8 COURT REPORTER: One through twelve.
- 9 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: One through twelve, and 8
- 10 through 16. Petitioner has offered similar exhibits as well,
- 11 so I'm going to admit Petitioner's 29.
- 12 (P-29 received.)
- 13 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Are there any other documents to
- 14 be introduced at this time?
- 15 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Petitioner is withdrawing Petitioner's
- 16 Exhibit 18.
- 17 (P-18 withdrawn.)
- 18 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: Okay. Thank you. Anything
- 19 else?
- 20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No, sir.
- 21 MR. CATALANO: We would like to talk about scheduling.
- 22 HEARING OFFICER DAVIS: We'll do that off the record.
- We are adjourned until May 11th at 9:30 a.m.
- Let's go off the record.
- 25 (Whereupon, at 11:24 a.m., the hearing was

1 adjourned until May 11, 2015 at 9:30 a.m.)
2

2

## 

This is to certify that the attached proceedings done before the NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD REGION TWO.

In the Matter of:

The New School

Employer,

And

Students Employees at The New School,

Petitioner.

Case No.: 2-RC-143009

Date: May 6, 2015

Place: New York, NY

Were held as therein appears, and that this is the original transcript thereof for the files of the Board.

Official Reporter